

# ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION

## In All 50 States

---

### FIFTH EDITION

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments .....	xvii
About the Author.....	xix
Notice.....	xxi
How to Use This Book .....	xxiii
Introduction .....	xxvii

#### CHAPTER 1

##### SUBROGATION GENERALLY

§ 1.01 Elements .....	1-1
§ 1.02 Origins of Subrogation.....	1-3
§ 1.03 Types of Subrogation.....	1-5
[1] Contractual (Conventional) Subrogation .....	1-6
[2] Equitable (Legal) Subrogation.....	1-7
[a] Difference between Subrogation and Assignment .....	1-8
[b] Roles of Equity .....	1-9
[3] Statutory Subrogation.....	1-15
[a] Workers' Compensation .....	1-15
[b] Hospital Liens.....	1-17
[c] Medicare.....	1-18
[d] Medicaid .....	1-23
[e] Medicare Advantage Plans .....	1-32
[f] Interplay between Workers' Compensation and Medicare/Medicaid .....	1-35
[g] Federal Employees Health Benefit Act (FEHBA) .....	1-37
[h] Other Statutory Subrogation .....	1-37
§ 1.04 Purposes of Subrogation .....	1-37
§ 1.05 Anti-Subrogation Arguments.....	1-40

#### CHAPTER 2

##### INSURED ERISA-COVERED EMPLOYEE WELFARE BENEFIT PLANS

§ 2.01 Generally.....	2-2
§ 2.02 Types of Health Plans .....	2-4
[1] Indemnity Plans .....	2-5
[2] Preferred Provider Organization (PPO).....	2-5
[3] Health Maintenance Organization (HMO).....	2-6
[4] Individual Practice Association (IPA).....	2-7
[5] Point-of-Service Plan (POS).....	2-7
§ 2.03 Multiple Employer Plans.....	2-7

**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES  
TABLE OF CONTENTS**

[1] Single-Employer Plans.....	2-7
[2] Multi-Employer Plans.....	2-8
[3] Multiple-Employer Welfare Association Plans (MEWA).....	2-10
[4] Voluntary Employees’ Beneficiary Association (VEBA).....	2-18
[5] Occupational Accident Plans.....	2-21
§ 2.04 Subrogation and Reimbursement Rights.....	2-22
[1] Subrogation Rights.....	2-23
[2] Reimbursement Rights.....	2-25
[3] Standing in the Shoes of the Insured.....	2-26
[4] Indemnity versus Investment Contracts.....	2-28
[5] No Multiple Recoveries.....	2-29
[6] Subrogation Arises with Payment.....	2-30
[7] Subrogation against Municipalities.....	2-30
§ 2.05 Requirement to Join Subrogated Party .....	2-31
[1] Wis. Stat. § 803.03 - Claims Arising by Subrogation .....	2-31
[2] Is the Subrogated Party a Plaintiff, Defendant or Other?.....	2-32
[3] The Reverse - Must Subrogated Party Join the Insured?.....	2-33
[4] The Need to Participate .....	2-33
[5] What Do You Do If You Are Not Joined?.....	2-34
§ 2.06 Notice to Subrogated Parties .....	2-34
§ 2.07 What Happens If the Plaintiff Loses at Trial? .....	2-35
§ 2.08 Made Whole Doctrine and Non-ERISA Health Plans .....	2-37
[1] <i>Garrity v. Rural Mutual Ins. Co.</i> .....	2-38
[2] <i>Rimes v. State Farm Mutual Auto Ins. Co.</i> .....	2-39
[3] What Does It Mean to Be “Made Whole”?.....	2-40
[a] Basic Test .....	2-40
[b] Contributory Negligence.....	2-41
[4] All Damages .....	2-48
[5] Attorney’s Fees .....	2-49
[6] Where Plan Specifically Negates Made Whole Doctrine .....	2-49
§ 2.09 Common Fund Doctrine and Non-ERISA Health Plans .....	2-57
§ 2.10 Statute of Limitations Issues .....	2-58
§ 2.11 Indemnification Agreements.....	2-59
§ 2.12 Subrogated Party on the Settlement Check: Is It Enough? .....	2-60
§ 2.13 Subrogating against Under/Uninsured Motorist Carriers .....	2-61
[1] “...A Responsible Third Party...” .....	2-61
[2] “...Any Party Who May Be Liable...” .....	2-62
[3] “...Caused, or Is Liable for...” .....	2-63
[4] Collateral Source Rules .....	2-63
[5] Anti-Subrogation Laws.....	2-66
[6] Summary .....	2-68

**CHAPTER 3**

**HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES**

Introduction.....	3-1
§ 3.01 Alabama.....	3-3
§ 3.02 Alaska.....	3-15

**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES  
TABLE OF CONTENTS**

§ 3.03	Arizona.....	3-23
§ 3.04	Arkansas.....	3-29
§ 3.05	California.....	3-35
§ 3.06	Colorado .....	3-53
§ 3.07	Connecticut.....	3-59
§ 3.08	Delaware.....	3-65
§ 3.09	District of Columbia .....	3-69
§ 3.10	Florida .....	3-75
§ 3.11	Georgia .....	3-83
§ 3.12	Hawaii .....	3-95
§ 3.13	Idaho .....	3-101
§ 3.14	Illinois .....	3-107
§ 3.15	Indiana .....	3-117
§ 3.16	Iowa .....	3-125
§ 3.17	Kansas.....	3-133
§ 3.18	Kentucky .....	3-141
§ 3.19	Louisiana.....	3-149
§ 3.20	Maine .....	3-161
§ 3.21	Maryland.....	3-167
§ 3.22	Massachusetts.....	3-177
§ 3.23	Michigan .....	3-185
§ 3.24	Minnesota.....	3-195
§ 3.25	Mississippi.....	3-203
§ 3.26	Missouri .....	3-207
§ 3.27	Montana .....	3-213
§ 3.28	Nebraska.....	3-223
§ 3.29	Nevada .....	3-229
§ 3.30	New Hampshire .....	3-235
§ 3.31	New Jersey.....	3-239
§ 3.32	New Mexico.....	3-249
§ 3.33	New York .....	3-255
§ 3.34	North Carolina .....	3-275
§ 3.35	North Dakota .....	3-281
§ 3.36	Ohio .....	3-285
§ 3.37	Oklahoma .....	3-297
§ 3.38	Oregon.....	3-303
§ 3.39	Pennsylvania .....	3-321
§ 3.40	Rhode Island .....	3-335
§ 3.41	South Carolina .....	3-339
§ 3.42	South Dakota .....	3-345
§ 3.43	Tennessee.....	3-349
§ 3.44	Texas.....	3-357
§ 3.45	Utah .....	3-371
§ 3.46	Vermont.....	3-377
§ 3.47	Virginia.....	3-381
§ 3.48	Washington.....	3-387
§ 3.49	West Virginia .....	3-393
§ 3.50	Wisconsin.....	3-397
§ 3.51	Wyoming.....	3-415

**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES  
TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**CHAPTER 4**

**SELF-FUNDED, ERISA-COVERED EMPLOYEE MEDICAL BENEFIT PLAN SUBROGATION**

§ 4.01	Introduction to ERISA .....	4-2
	[1] History of ERISA .....	4-2
	[2] Background .....	4-3
	[3] Enactment and Purpose.....	4-5
	[4] Scope of ERISA .....	4-6
	[5] Definitions - The Language of ERISA .....	4-7
	[6] Trust, Contract, and Labor Law Parallels .....	4-9
	[a] Trust Law .....	4-9
	[b] Contract Law.....	4-11
	[c] Labor Law.....	4-12
	[7] Federal Common Law .....	4-12
§ 4.02	What Is an ERISA Plan? .....	4-14
	[1] Self-Funded Plans versus Insured Plans.....	4-16
	[2] Stop-Loss Coverage.....	4-22
	[3] General Rule to Determine Whether Plan Is ERISA-Covered .....	4-28
	[4] Safe Harbor Regulations .....	4-32
	[5] Plans Not Subject to ERISA.....	4-34
	[a] Government Plans and Church Plans .....	4-34
	[b] Trade Association Plans and Employees’ Beneficiary Associations.....	4-36
	[c] Plans That Cover Owners and Not Employees .....	4-39
	[d] Multi-Employer Plans .....	4-39
	[e] Entities Not Engaged in Interstate Commerce .....	4-41
	[f] Subrogating Insured ERISA-Covered Plans .....	4-41
	[6] Other Plans Subject to ERISA .....	4-41
	[a] HMO Plans .....	4-41
	[b] Plans Administered by Employer.....	4-42
	[c] Occupational Accident Plans .....	4-42
	[7] What Constitutes the Plan? .....	4-47
	[a] Coverage Booklet.....	4-47
	[b] Summary Plan Description (SPD).....	4-47
	[c] Wrap Documents.....	4-48

**CHAPTER 5**

**ERISA PREEMPTION**

§ 5.01	Preemption, Saving and Deemer Clauses.....	5-2
	[1] Preemption Clause.....	5-4
	[2] Saving Clause .....	5-8
	[3] Deemer Clause.....	5-10
§ 5.02	Two Types of Preemption - Complete and Conflict.....	5-14
	[1] Complete Preemption (Narrow Preemption) .....	5-16
	[2] Conflict Preemption (Broad Preemption) .....	5-20
§ 5.03	ERISA Preemption of State Law Where Plan Is Insured and Not “Self-Funded” .....	5-23
§ 5.04	When Does State Law “Relate to” an Employee Benefit Plan?.....	5-25
§ 5.05	When Does State Law “Regulate Insurance”?.....	5-30

**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES**  
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

§ 5.06	Preemption of State Court Judgments and Orders .....	5-37
§ 5.07	Erosion of Preemption.....	5-38

**CHAPTER 6**

**ERISA AND THE MADE WHOLE DOCTRINE**

§ 6.01	Introduction.....	6-2
§ 6.02	Made Whole Doctrine as Default Rule .....	6-3
§ 6.03	Applied to Self-Funded Plans.....	6-4
§ 6.04	Doctrine Affected by Reimbursement Provision.....	6-10
§ 6.05	Presumption Against Made Whole Doctrine.....	6-12
§ 6.06	Made Whole Doctrine as Gap Filler.....	6-14
§ 6.07	Effect of Plan Administrator’s Interpretation.....	6-14
§ 6.08	Made Whole Doctrine Applicable unless Specifically Negated by Plan Language.....	6-14
§ 6.09	Made Whole Doctrine under Federal Common Law.....	6-19
§ 6.10	Definition of Made Whole .....	6-20
§ 6.11	Where Beneficiary Violates Plan’s Cooperation Clause .....	6-22
§ 6.12	Made Whole Doctrine Doesn’t Affect Other Duties under Plan .....	6-22
§ 6.13	Effect of Exclusionary/Excess Language .....	6-23
§ 6.14	Examples of Specific Plan Language .....	6-24
§ 6.15	Treatment of Made Whole Doctrine by Circuit.....	6-26
	[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI) .....	6-26
	[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT) .....	6-27
	[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands).....	6-27
	[4] Fourth Circuit (MD, NC, SC, VA, WV) .....	6-28
	[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX) .....	6-28
	[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN) .....	6-29
	[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI) .....	6-33
	[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD).....	6-34
	[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands).....	6-36
	[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY).....	6-40
	[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA).....	6-41
	[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia) .....	6-43

**CHAPTER 7**

**ERISA AND THE COMMON FUND DOCTRINE**

§ 7.01	Introduction.....	7-2
§ 7.02	Plan Language: “Out of Any Monies Recovered” and “All Rights of Recovery” .....	7-3
§ 7.03	“Full Reimbursement” Language.....	7-4
§ 7.04	Absence of Language Exempting Common Fund Doctrine .....	7-4
§ 7.05	Plan Language Clearly Exempts Common Fund Doctrine.....	7-10
§ 7.06	Effect of Plan Administrator’s Interpretation.....	7-12
§ 7.07	Common Fund Doctrine Under Federal Common Law .....	7-12
§ 7.08	Hourly or Contingency Fee? .....	7-14
§ 7.09	Notice of Litigation Requirement .....	7-15
§ 7.10	Who May Raise a Common Fund Claim?.....	7-16
§ 7.11	Treatment of Common Fund Doctrine by Circuit.....	7-17

**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES**  
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI) .....	7-18
[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT) .....	7-19
[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands).....	7-19
[4] Fourth Circuit (MD, NC, SC, VA, WV) .....	7-20
[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX) .....	7-21
[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN) .....	7-21
[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI) .....	7-22
[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD).....	7-23
[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands).....	7-24
[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY).....	7-26
[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA).....	7-27
[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia) .....	7-28

**CHAPTER 8**

**RIGHTS OF RECOVERY: SUBROGATION AND REIMBURSEMENT**

§ 8.01 Introduction.....	8-2
§ 8.02 Persons Who Can Pursue Subrogation.....	8-3
§ 8.03 Venue.....	8-7
§ 8.04 Parties Authorized to Bring Action .....	8-9
§ 8.05 Jurisdiction.....	8-11
§ 8.06 Removal .....	8-17
§ 8.07 Problem Circuits .....	8-31
§ 8.08 Abstention .....	8-33
§ 8.09 Intervention .....	8-35
[1] State Court .....	8-35
[2] Federal Court .....	8-38
§ 8.10 Rights of Recovery: Subrogation and Reimbursement .....	8-40
[1] Recovery Rights Generally .....	8-40
[2] Plan Language Determines Subrogation Rights.....	8-43
[3] Recovery Rights under ERISA.....	8-43
[4] Types of Recovery Provisions.....	8-44
[a] Subrogation Provisions.....	8-45
[b] Reimbursement Provisions.....	8-46
[c] Exclusionary Provisions.....	8-46
[d] No Subrogation Language .....	8-48
[5] Subrogation Receipts and Reimbursement Agreements.....	8-49
[a] Subrogation Agreement Does Not Control .....	8-49
[b] Subrogation Agreement Does Control .....	8-51
[6] Recovery Priorities .....	8-54
[a] Elements of Damages (Gerrymandering) .....	8-55
[b] Allocation of Recovery among Beneficiaries .....	8-67
[c] First Money Recovered.....	8-72
[d] Subrogating for More Than Benefits Paid .....	8-73
[e] Plaintiff’s Attorney’s Fees.....	8-73
[f] Gray Areas .....	8-76
[g] Causation.....	8-76
[7] Reimbursement Rights.....	8-80

**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES  
TABLE OF CONTENTS**

[8] Sue in the Name of Plan or Third Party Administrator? .....	8-83
[9] Credit against Future Benefits .....	8-84
[10] Summary Plan Description (SPD) .....	8-92
[11] Summary Plan Description as Formal Plan Document.....	8-97
[13] Plan Fiduciary’s Interpretation of Plan Language .....	8-102
[14] Multiple Plan Documents–Conflicting Terms .....	8-109
§ 8.11 Injunctions.....	8-112
§ 8.12 Constructive Trusts and Equitable Liens.....	8-115
§ 8.13 Restitution .....	8-118
§ 8.14 Declaratory Judgment Actions .....	8-124

**CHAPTER 9**

**WHAT CONSTITUTES “OTHER APPROPRIATE EQUITABLE RELIEF?”**

§ 9.01 History And Early Treatment .....	9-1
[1] <i>Mertens v. Hewett Assocs.</i> , 508 U.S. 248 (1993) .....	9-2
[2] <i>Reynolds Metal Co. v. Ellis</i> , 202 F.3d 1246 (9 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 2000).....	9-3
[3] <i>Bauhaus (U.S.A.), Inc. v. Copeland</i> , 292 F.3d 439 (5 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 2002) .....	9-6
§ 9.02 <i>Great West Life &amp; Annuity Ins. Co. v. Knudson</i> , 534 U.S. 204 (2002) .....	9-6
[1] Why The Supreme Court Got It Wrong In <i>Knudson</i> .....	9-10
§ 9.03 <i>Sereboff v. Mid Atlantic Medical Services, L.L.C.</i> , 547 U.S. 356 (2006).....	9-14
§ 9.04 <i>US Airways v. McCutchen</i> , 663 F.3d 671 (3 <sup>rd</sup> Cir. 2011).....	9-18
[1] Subsequent Treatment Of <i>McCutchen</i> .....	9-22
§ 9.05 Practical Application Of The “Other Appropriate Equitable Relief” Issue.....	9-24
§ 9.06 History of Treatment of “Other Appropriate Equitable Relief” Issue By Federal Court.....	9-27
[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI) .....	9-29
[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT) .....	9-31
[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands).....	9-34
[4] Fourth Circuit (MD, NC, SC, VA, WV) .....	9-35
[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX) .....	9-38
[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN) .....	9-42
[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI) .....	9-44
[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD).....	9-46
[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands).....	9-50
[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY).....	9-54
[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA).....	9-55
[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia) .....	9-61
§ 9.07 Summary of Judicial Treatment Of “Appropriate Equitable Relief” .....	9-62
§ 9.08 Possible Congressional Action to Address The Issue.....	9-67
§ 9.09 Future Trends .....	9-69

**CHAPTER 10**

**OTHER ERISA RECOVERY ISSUES**

§ 10.01 Medical Malpractice Recoveries .....	10-2
§ 10.02 Uninsured Motorist Benefits.....	10-3
§ 10.03 Med Pay and PIP Benefits .....	10-14
§ 10.04 No-Fault Insurance Laws .....	10-16

**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES  
TABLE OF CONTENTS**

§ 10.05	Anti-Subrogation Laws .....	10-18
§ 10.06	“Regulation of Insurance” Test .....	10-24
§ 10.07	Lien Reduction Statutes .....	10-26
§ 10.08	Common Fund Doctrine Statutes.....	10-26
§ 10.09	State Collateral Source Rules .....	10-32
§ 10.10	Federal Employees Health Benefit Act (FEHBA).....	10-37
§ 10.11	Other State Statutes.....	10-48
§ 10.12	Federal Common Law.....	10-49
§ 10.13	Laws regarding Minors .....	10-51
§ 10.14	Recovery of Benefit Payments Made by Mistake .....	10-52
	[1] Mistake of Fact.....	10-55
	[2] Mistake of Law .....	10-57
	[3] Overpayment of Benefits (Social Security) .....	10-57
§ 10.15	Coordination of Benefits (COB).....	10-60
§ 10.16	NAIC Group Coordination of Benefits Model Regulation.....	10-78
§ 10.17	HIPAA, HITECH, Medical Privacy, and Subrogation.....	10-81
	[1] The Problem: Medical Record Privacy .....	10-81
	[2] The Solutions: HIPAA’s and HITECH’s Privacy Regulations .....	10-82
	[3] HIPAA’s and HITECH’s Impact on Subrogation.....	10-83
	[4] The Federal Services Modernization Act (FSMA).....	10-86
	[5] HIPAA and Workers’ Compensation Claims.....	10-88
	[6] Summary.....	10-89
§ 10.18	Reimbursement From Workers’ Comp Claims.....	10-90
§ 10.19	Attorney’s Fees.....	10-102
§ 10.20	Choice-of-Law Provisions .....	10-109
§ 10.21	Statutes of Limitations .....	10-109
§ 10.22	Right to Jury Trial.....	10-112
§ 10.23	Equitable Estoppel.....	10-113
§ 10.24	Bankruptcy .....	10-113
§ 10.25	Bad Faith.....	10-122
§ 10.26	Causation.....	10-125

**CHAPTER 11**

**ENFORCEMENT OF REIMBURSEMENT RIGHTS AFTER SETTLEMENT**

§ 11.01	Introduction.....	11-1
§ 11.02	Federal Court Jurisdiction .....	11-2
§ 11.03	Unjust Enrichment.....	11-3
§ 11.04	Effect of Release of Third Party by Participant .....	11-7
§ 11.05	Tortious Interference .....	11-09
§ 11.06	Liability of Plaintiffs’ Counsel .....	11-10
	[1] Generally .....	11-10
	[2] Equitable Relief .....	11-11
	[3] Breach of Contract .....	11-14
	[4] Tortious Interference With a Contract.....	11-23
	[5] Implied Contract with Law Firm .....	11-29
	[6] Breach of Fiduciary Duty .....	11-29
	[7] Equitable Lien By Agreement .....	11-30



**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES  
TABLE OF CONTENTS**

[8] Plaintiff’s Counsels’ Ethical Considerations.....	11-31
§ 11.07 State Court Jurisdiction after <i>Knudson</i> and <i>Sereboff</i> .....	11-33
[1] Narrow View .....	11-37
[2] Broad View.....	11-38
[3] Modern View .....	11-39
§ 11.08 Special Needs Trusts.....	11-40

**CHAPTER 12**

**IMPROVING PLAN LANGUAGE**

**CHAPTER 13**

**HIRING SUBROGATION COUNSEL**

**APPENDICES**

A-1 Wis. Stat. § 803.03 – <i>Joinder of Persons Needed for Just and Complete Adjudication</i> .....	A-1
A-2 29 U.S.C. § 1102 – <i>Establishment of Plan</i> .....	A-5
A-3 Bad ERISA Plan Subrogation Language.....	A-7
A-4 Good ERISA Plan Subrogation Language .....	A-9
A-5 29 U.S.C. § 1003 – <i>Coverage</i> .....	A-13
A-6 29 U.S.C. § 1144 – <i>Other laws</i> .....	A-15
A-7 Geographic Boundaries of United States Courts of Appeals and United States District Courts.....	A-21
A-8 29 U.S.C. § 1132 – <i>Civil enforcement</i> .....	A-23
A-9 28 U.S.C. § 1331 – <i>Federal question</i> .....	A-33
A-10 Form 5500 – Annual Return/Report of Employee Benefit Plan .....	A-35
A-11 <i>Sereboff v. Mid Atlantic Medical Service, Inc.</i> .....	A-39
A-12 <i>Great-West Life &amp; Annuity Ins. Co. v. Knudson</i> .....	A-53
A-13 Curriculum Vitae of Gary L. Wickert.....	A-83
Table of Cases .....	TC-1
Table of Statutes.....	TS-1
Table of Other Authorities.....	TOA-1