

# AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE SUBROGATION

## In All 50 States (Second Edition)

Gary L. Wickert

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                            |       |
|----------------------------|-------|
| Acknowledgments .....      | xi    |
| About the Author.....      | xiii  |
| Disclaimer .....           | xv    |
| Notice.....                | xvii  |
| How to Use This Book ..... | xix   |
| Introduction .....         | xxiii |

### CHAPTER 1 SUBROGATION GENERALLY

|  |      |
|--|------|
| § 1.01 Elements.....   | 1-1  |
| § 1.02 Origins of Subrogation .....                                    | 1-3  |
| § 1.03 Types of Subrogation .....                                      | 1-4  |
| [1] Contractual (Conventional) Subrogation .....                       | 1-5  |
| [2] Equitable (Legal) Subrogation.....                                 | 1-7  |
| [a] Difference between Subrogation and Assignment.....                 | 1-7  |
| [b] Roles of Equity .....  | 1-8  |
| [3] Statutory Subrogation .....  | 1-13 |
| [a] Workers' Compensation .....  | 1-14 |
| [b] Hospital Liens.....  | 1-16 |
| [c] Medicare .....   | 1-16 |
| [d] Medicaid .....   | 1-21 |
| [e] Interplay between Workers' Compensation and Medicare/Medicaid..... | 1-26 |
| [f] Federal Employees Health Benefit Act .....                         | 1-27 |
| [g] Other Statutory Subrogation .....                                  | 1-27 |
| § 1.04 Purposes of Subrogation .....                                   | 1-28 |
| § 1.05 Anti-Subrogation Arguments .....                                | 1-30 |

### CHAPTER 2 AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| § 2.01 Generally.....                              | 2-2 |
| § 2.02 History of Automobile Insurance.....        | 2-3 |
| [1] Origins .....                                  | 2-3 |
| [2] History of the Automobile .....                | 2-4 |
| [3] Automobile Insurance in America.....           | 2-5 |
| § 2.03 Types of Automobile Insurance Coverage..... | 2-5 |
| [1] Bodily Injury Liability .....                  | 2-6 |
| [2] Property Damage Liability.....                 | 2-6 |
| [3] Medical Payments Liability .....               | 2-6 |
| [4] Personal Injury Protection .....               | 2-7 |
| [5] Uninsured/Underinsured Motorist Coverage.....  | 2-8 |

|        |  |      |
|--------|--|------|
| [6]    | Collision and Comprehensive Coverage.....      | 2-10 |
| [7]    | Add-Ons and Riders.....                        | 2-10 |
|        | [a] Rental Reimbursement Coverage .....        | 2-10 |
|        | [b] Towing and Labor Coverage .....            | 2-11 |
|        | [c] Gap Auto Insurance Coverage.....           | 2-11 |
|        | [d] Waiver of Depreciation Coverage .....      | 2-11 |
| [8]    | Commercial Automobile Coverage .....           | 2-11 |
|        | [a] Automobile Liability .....                 | 2-12 |
|        | [b] Hired and Non-Owned Coverage .....         | 2-12 |
|        | [c] Medical Payments.....                      | 2-12 |
|        | [d] Personal Injury Protection .....           | 2-12 |
|        | [e] Uninsured Motorist Coverage.....           | 2-12 |
|        | [f] Underinsured Motorist Coverage.....        | 2-13 |
|        | [g] Pollution Exclusion—Upset & Overturn.....  | 2-13 |
|        | [h] Drive Other Vehicle Coverage .....         | 2-13 |
|        | [i] Collision Coverage .....                   | 2-14 |
|        | [j] Comprehensive Coverage.....                | 2-14 |
|        | [k] Garage Liability Coverage.....             | 2-14 |
|        | [l] Garagekeeper’s Liability Coverage .....    | 2-14 |
| § 2.04 | No-Fault Insurance Coverage .....              | 2-15 |
|        | [1] Generally.....                             | 2-15 |
|        | [2] History .....                              | 2-16 |
|        | [3] Personal Injury Protection Benefits .....  | 2-17 |
|        | [4] Thresholds.....                            | 2-17 |
|        | [5] Limited Tort.....                          | 2-18 |
|        | [6] Loss Transfer Statutes.....                | 2-19 |
|        | [7] No-Fault States .....                      | 2-20 |
|        | [a] Modified No-Fault .....                    | 2-20 |
|        | [b] Add-On No-Fault.....                       | 2-20 |
|        | [c] Voluntary (“Choice”) No-Fault .....        | 2-21 |
|        | [8] Effectiveness and Future of No-Fault ..... | 2-21 |

**CHAPTER 3**  
**SUBROGATING MEDICAL AND PROPERTY DAMAGE CLAIMS**

|        |  |      |
|--------|--|------|
| § 3.01 | Auto Subrogation and the American Tort System.....                 | 3-3  |
| § 3.02 | Subrogation Suits and Interventions .....                          | 3-5  |
|        | [1] Filing a Subrogation Lawsuit.....                              | 3-6  |
|        | [2] Intervention in a Bodily Injury Action.....                    | 3-7  |
|        | [a] Mandatory Joinder of Subrogated Party .....                    | 3-8  |
|        | [b] Is the Subrogated Party a Plaintiff, Defendant or Other? ..... | 3-9  |
|        | [c] The Reverse—Must Subrogated Party Join the Insured? .....      | 3-10 |
|        | [d] What Do You Do if You Are Not Joined?.....                     | 3-12 |
|        | [3] Use of Subrogation Counsel .....                               | 3-13 |
| § 3.03 | Made Whole Doctrine .....  | 3-16 |
|        | [1] <i>Garrity v. Rural Mutual Ins. Co.</i> .....                  | 3-17 |
|        | [2] <i>Rimes v. State Farm Mutual Auto Ins. Co.</i> .....          | 3-17 |
|        | [3] What Does It Mean to Be Made Whole?.....                       | 3-19 |
|        | [a] Basic Test .....   | 3-19 |
|        | [b] Contributory Negligence.....                                   | 3-19 |
|        | [4] Allocation of Damages .....                                    | 3-26 |
|        | [5] Attorney’s Fees .....  | 3-27 |
|        | [6] Where Policy Specifically Negates Made Whole Doctrine .....    | 3-27 |

|        |   |      |
|--------|---|------|
| § 3.04 | Common Fund Doctrine .....                                | 3-34 |
| § 3.05 | Statute of Limitations.....                               | 3-36 |
| § 3.06 | Uninsured Motorist Subrogation .....                      | 3-37 |
|        | [1] Generally.....  | 3-38 |
|        | [2] Collection Law.....                                   | 3-38 |
|        | [3] Consent-to-Sue Clause.....                            | 3-39 |
|        | [4] Consent-to-Settle Clause.....                         | 3-39 |
|        | [5] Substituted Payments.....                             | 3-40 |
|        | [6] UM/UIM Offsets.....                                   | 3-42 |
|        | [a] Personal Injury Protection (PIP) Payments .....       | 3-42 |
|        | [b] Liability Payments .....                              | 3-43 |
| § 3.07 | Collision Subrogation .....                               | 3-43 |
| § 3.08 | PIP/Med Pay Subrogation .....                             | 3-45 |
|        | [1] Overview .....  | 3-45 |
|        | [2] PIP Subrogation.....                                  | 3-48 |
|        | [3] Med Pay Subrogation.....                              | 3-49 |
| § 3.09 | Release of Tortfeasor by Insured .....                    | 3-49 |
| § 3.10 | Waiting for Insured’s Bodily Injury Claim to Settle ..... | 3-50 |
|        | [1] Third-Party Carrier Requirement.....                  | 3-51 |
|        | [2] Statutory Requirement.....                            | 3-51 |
| § 3.11 | Anti-Subrogation Statutes.....                            | 3-51 |
| § 3.12 | Arbitration.....  | 3-53 |
|        | [1] Generally.....  | 3-53 |
|        | [2] History of Arbitration .....                          | 3-54 |
|        | [3] Intercompany Arbitration .....                        | 3-56 |
|        | [a] Auto Subrogation Arbitration .....                    | 3-57 |
|        | [b] Personal Injury Protection Arbitration .....          | 3-58 |
|        | [c] Medical Payment Subrogation Arbitration.....          | 3-59 |
|        | [d] Uninsured Motorists’ Subrogation .....                | 3-59 |
|        | [e] Special Arbitration .....                             | 3-60 |
|        | [f] Claims Excluded for Arbitration.....                  | 3-60 |
|        | [4] Intercompany Arbitration Providers .....              | 3-61 |
|        | [5] Arbitration Services and Outsourcing.....             | 3-62 |
|        | [6] Use of Subrogation Counsel in Arbitration .....       | 3-63 |
| § 3.13 | Reimbursement of Insured’s Deductible .....               | 3-63 |
| § 3.14 | Rental Vehicles, Loaner Vehicles, and Test Drivers.....   | 3-69 |
| § 3.15 | Bailment .....  | 3-72 |
| § 3.16 | Guest Statutes/Family Purpose Doctrine.....               | 3-74 |
|        | [1] Guest Statutes .....                                  | 3-74 |
|        | [2] Family Purpose Doctrine .....                         | 3-77 |
|        | [3] Parental-Immunity Doctrine .....                      | 3-78 |
| § 3.17 | Economic Loss Doctrine .....                              | 3-80 |
|        | [1] Definition of “Economic Loss” .....                   | 3-80 |
|        | [2] Purpose of Economic Loss Doctrine.....                | 3-82 |
|        | [3] History of Economic Loss Doctrine .....               | 3-82 |
|        | [4] Minority Rule.....                                    | 3-83 |
|        | [5] Majority Rule.....                                    | 3-84 |
|        | [6] Intermediate Rule.....                                | 3-85 |
|        | [7] “Other Property” Exception.....                       | 3-86 |
|        | [8] Warranties.....                                       | 3-87 |
|        | [9] Economic Loss Doctrine in Wisconsin.....              | 3-88 |
|        | [a] Generally.....  | 3-88 |

|        |   |       |
|--------|---|-------|
|        | [b] First Recognized .....                                  | 3-88  |
|        | [c] "Other Property" Exception.....                         | 3-89  |
|        | [d] Component Parts .....                                   | 3-90  |
|        | [e] Asbestos Exception .....                                | 3-91  |
|        | [f] Privity .....   | 3-91  |
|        | [g] Consumer Transactions .....                             | 3-91  |
|        | [h] Public Policy Exception .....                           | 3-92  |
|        | [i] Fraud and Misrepresentation .....                       | 3-92  |
|        | [j] Service Contract versus Product.....                    | 3-94  |
| § 3.18 | Multiple Claims in Excess of Liability Limits .....         | 3-95  |
|        | [1] First Come, First Served Approach.....                  | 3-95  |
|        | [2] First to Judgment Approach.....                         | 3-96  |
|        | [3] Pro Rata Approach.....                                  | 3-96  |
|        | [4] Good Faith, Bad Faith Approach.....                     | 3-96  |
|        | [5] Interpleader .....                                      | 3-97  |
| § 3.19 | Interstate Subrogation and Conflict of Laws.....            | 3-97  |
|        | [1] Interstate Subrogation .....                            | 3-97  |
|        | [2] Conflict of Laws .....                                  | 3-97  |
| § 3.20 | Subrogation and Fair Debt Collection Practices.....         | 3-102 |
|        | [1] Federal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act (FDCPA)..... | 3-103 |
|        | [2] State Law -- Consumer Protection Acts.....              | 3-109 |
| § 3.21 | Direct Action Statutes .....                                | 3-117 |

**CHAPTER 4**  
**AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES**

|        |                            |       |
|--------|----------------------------|-------|
|        | Introduction .....         | 4-1   |
| § 4.01 | Alabama .....              | 4-3   |
| § 4.02 | Alaska .....               | 4-41  |
| § 4.03 | Arizona .....              | 4-67  |
| § 4.04 | Arkansas.....              | 4-91  |
| § 4.05 | California.....            | 4-127 |
| § 4.06 | Colorado .....             | 4-175 |
| § 4.07 | Connecticut.....           | 4-215 |
| § 4.08 | Delaware.....              | 4-247 |
| § 4.09 | District of Columbia ..... | 4-283 |
| § 4.10 | Florida .....              | 4-309 |
| § 4.11 | Georgia .....              | 4-357 |
| § 4.12 | Hawaii .....               | 4-395 |
| § 4.13 | Idaho .....                | 4-437 |
| § 4.14 | Illinois .....             | 4-457 |
| § 4.15 | Indiana .....              | 4-507 |
| § 4.16 | Iowa .....                 | 4-541 |
| § 4.17 | Kansas.....                | 4-565 |
| § 4.18 | Kentucky .....             | 4-591 |
| § 4.19 | Louisiana.....             | 4-629 |
| § 4.20 | Maine .....                | 4-667 |
| § 4.21 | Maryland.....              | 4-689 |
| § 4.22 | Massachusetts.....         | 4-717 |
| § 4.23 | Michigan .....             | 4-747 |

|        |                      |        |
|--------|----------------------|--------|
| § 4.24 | Minnesota.....       | 4-807  |
| § 4.25 | Mississippi.....     | 4-841  |
| § 4.26 | Missouri .....       | 4-859  |
| § 4.27 | Montana .....        | 4-885  |
| § 4.28 | Nebraska.....        | 4-911  |
| § 4.29 | Nevada .....         | 4-931  |
| § 4.30 | New Hampshire .....  | 4-951  |
| § 4.31 | New Jersey.....      | 4-969  |
| § 4.32 | New Mexico.....      | 4-1017 |
| § 4.33 | New York .....       | 4-1035 |
| § 4.34 | North Carolina ..... | 4-1105 |
| § 4.35 | North Dakota .....   | 4-1125 |
| § 4.36 | Ohio.....            | 4-1149 |
| § 4.37 | Oklahoma .....       | 4-1181 |
| § 4.38 | Oregon.....          | 4-1203 |
| § 4.39 | Pennsylvania.....    | 4-1237 |
| § 4.40 | Rhode Island .....   | 4-1271 |
| § 4.41 | South Carolina ..... | 4-1287 |
| § 4.42 | South Dakota .....   | 4-1303 |
| § 4.43 | Tennessee.....       | 4-1319 |
| § 4.44 | Texas.....           | 4-1339 |
| § 4.45 | Utah .....           | 4-1377 |
| § 4.46 | Vermont.....         | 4-1397 |
| § 4.47 | Virginia.....        | 4-1413 |
| § 4.48 | Washington.....      | 4-1435 |
| § 4.49 | West Virginia .....  | 4-1471 |
| § 4.50 | Wisconsin.....       | 4-1499 |
| § 4.51 | Wyoming.....         | 4-1541 |

**CHAPTER 5**  
**SUSPENSION OF DRIVER LICENSES AND CRIMINAL RESTITUTION**

|                                 |   |       |
|---------------------------------|---|-------|
| § 5.01                          | Suspension of Driver Licenses Generally.....      | 5-1   |
| § 5.02                          | Driver’s License: Privilege or Right .....        | 5-2   |
| § 5.03                          | Criminal Restitution Generally .....              | 5-4   |
| § 5.04                          | Suspending Driver Licenses in All 50 States ..... | 5-5   |
| Table of Cases .....            |   | TC-1  |
| Table of Statutes.....          |   | TS-1  |
| Table of Other Authorities..... |   | TOA-1 |

Gary L. Wickert  
**MATTHIESEN, WICKERT & LEHRER, S.C.**  
P.O. Box 270670  
Hartford, WI 53027  
(262) 673-7850  
(262) 673-3766 (Fax)  
[gwickert@mwl-law.com](mailto:gwickert@mwl-law.com)  
[www.mwl-law.com](http://www.mwl-law.com)