

AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE SUBROGATION

In All 50 States

Gary L. Wickert

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|----------------------------|------|
| Acknowledgments | ix |
| About the Author..... | xi |
| Disclaimer | xiii |
| Notice..... | xv |
| How to Use This Book | xvii |
| Introduction | xxi |

CHAPTER 1 SUBROGATION GENERALLY

| | |
|--|------|
| § 1.01 Elements..... | 1-1 |
| § 1.02 Origins of Subrogation | 1-3 |
| § 1.03 Types of Subrogation | 1-5 |
| [1] Contractual (Conventional) Subrogation | 1-5 |
| [2] Equitable (Legal) Subrogation..... | 1-7 |
| [a] Difference between Subrogation and Assignment..... | 1-7 |
| [b] Roles of Equity | 1-8 |
| [3] Statutory Subrogation..... | 1-14 |
| [a] Workers' Compensation | 1-14 |
| [b] Hospital Liens..... | 1-16 |
| [c] Medicare | 1-17 |
| [d] Medicaid | 1-21 |
| [e] Interplay between Workers' Compensation and Medicare/Medicaid..... | 1-26 |
| [f] Federal Employees Health Benefit Act | 1-27 |
| [g] Other Statutory Subrogation | 1-28 |
| § 1.04 Purposes of Subrogation | 1-28 |
| § 1.05 Anti-Subrogation Arguments | 1-30 |

CHAPTER 2 AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE

| | |
|--|-----|
| § 2.01 Generally..... | 2-2 |
| § 2.02 History of Automobile Insurance..... | 2-3 |
| [1] Origins | 2-3 |
| [2] History of the Automobile..... | 2-4 |
| [3] Automobile Insurance in America..... | 2-5 |
| § 2.03 Types of Automobile Insurance Coverage..... | 2-5 |
| [1] Bodily Injury Liability | 2-6 |
| [2] Property Damage Liability..... | 2-6 |
| [3] Medical Payments Liability | 2-6 |
| [4] Personal Injury Protection | 2-7 |

| | | |
|--------|--|------|
| [5] | Uninsured/Underinsured Motorist Coverage | 2-8 |
| [6] | Collision and Comprehensive Coverage | 2-8 |
| [7] | Add-Ons and Riders..... | 2-9 |
| | [a] Rental Reimbursement Coverage | 2-9 |
| | [b] Towing and Labor Coverage | 2-9 |
| | [c] Gap Auto Insurance Coverage | 2-9 |
| | [d] Waiver of Depreciation Coverage..... | 2-10 |
| [8] | Commercial Automobile Coverage | 2-10 |
| | [a] Automobile Liability..... | 2-10 |
| | [b] Hired and Non-Owned Coverage..... | 2-10 |
| | [c] Medical Payments | 2-11 |
| | [d] Personal Injury Protection | 2-11 |
| | [e] Uninsured Motorist Coverage | 2-11 |
| | [f] Underinsured Motorist Coverage..... | 2-11 |
| | [g] Pollution Exclusion—Upset & Overturn | 2-11 |
| | [h] Drive Other Vehicle Coverage..... | 2-12 |
| | [i] Collision Coverage..... | 2-12 |
| | [j] Comprehensive Coverage..... | 2-12 |
| | [k] Garage Liability Coverage | 2-12 |
| | [l] Garagekeeper’s Liability Coverage | 2-13 |
| § 2.04 | No-Fault Insurance Coverage | 2-13 |
| | [1] Generally | 2-13 |
| | [2] History | 2-14 |
| | [3] Personal Injury Protection Benefits | 2-15 |
| | [4] Thresholds..... | 2-15 |
| | [5] Limited Tort..... | 2-16 |
| | [6] Loss Transfer Statutes | 2-17 |
| | [7] No-Fault States..... | 2-18 |
| | [a] Modified No-Fault..... | 2-18 |
| | [b] Add-On No-Fault..... | 2-18 |
| | [c] Voluntary (“Choice”) No-Fault..... | 2-19 |
| [8] | Effectiveness and Future of No-Fault..... | 2-19 |

CHAPTER 3
SUBROGATING MEDICAL AND PROPERTY DAMAGE CLAIMS

| | | |
|--------|--|------|
| § 3.01 | Auto Subrogation and the American Tort System..... | 3-3 |
| § 3.02 | Subrogation Suits and Interventions | 3-5 |
| | [1] Filing a Subrogation Lawsuit | 3-6 |
| | [2] Intervention in a Bodily Injury Action | 3-7 |
| | [a] Mandatory Joinder of Subrogated Party | 3-8 |
| | [b] Is the Subrogated Party a Plaintiff, Defendant or Other? | 3-9 |
| | [c] The Reverse—Must Subrogated Party Join the Insured?..... | 3-10 |
| | [d] What Do You Do if You Are Not Joined?..... | 3-12 |
| | [3] Use of Subrogation Counsel..... | 3-13 |
| § 3.03 | Made Whole Doctrine | 3-16 |
| | [1] <i>Garrity v. Rural Mutual Ins. Co.</i> | 3-17 |
| | [2] <i>Rimes v. State Farm Mutual Auto Ins. Co.</i> | 3-17 |
| | [3] What Does It Mean to Be Made Whole? | 3-19 |
| | [a] Basic Test | 3-19 |

| | | |
|--------|--|------|
| | [b] Contributory Negligence..... | 3-19 |
| | [4] Allocation of Damages | 3-26 |
| | [5] Attorney’s Fees | 3-27 |
| | [6] Where Policy Specifically Negates Made Whole Doctrine..... | 3-27 |
| § 3.04 | Common Fund Doctrine | 3-34 |
| § 3.05 | Statute of Limitations..... | 3-36 |
| § 3.06 | Uninsured Motorist Subrogation | 3-37 |
| | [1] Generally..... | 3-37 |
| | [2] Collection Law..... | 3-37 |
| | [3] Substituted Payments..... | 3-38 |
| § 3.07 | Release of Tortfeasor by Insured | 3-40 |
| § 3.08 | Waiting for Insured’s Bodily Injury Claim to Settle | 3-41 |
| | [1] Third-Party Carrier Requirement..... | 3-42 |
| | [2] Statutory Requirement..... | 3-42 |
| § 3.09 | Anti-Subrogation Statutes..... | 3-42 |
| § 3.10 | Arbitration..... | 3-45 |
| | [1] Generally..... | 3-45 |
| | [2] History of Arbitration | 3-45 |
| | [3] Intercompany Arbitration | 3-47 |
| | [a] Auto Subrogation Arbitration | 3-49 |
| | [b] Personal Injury Protection Arbitration | 3-49 |
| | [c] Medical Payment Subrogation Arbitration..... | 3-50 |
| | [d] Uninsured Motorists’ Subrogation | 3-51 |
| | [e] Special Arbitration | 3-51 |
| | [f] Claims Excluded for Arbitration..... | 3-51 |
| | [4] Intercompany Arbitration Providers | 3-52 |
| | [5] Arbitration Services and Outsourcing..... | 3-54 |
| | [6] Use of Subrogation Counsel in Arbitration | 3-54 |
| § 3.11 | Reimbursement of Insured’s Deductible | 3-54 |
| § 3.12 | Rental Vehicles, Loaner Vehicles, and Test Drivers..... | 3-59 |
| § 3.13 | Bailment | 3-63 |
| § 3.14 | Guest Statutes/Family Purpose Doctrine..... | 3-64 |
| | [1] Guest Statutes..... | 3-64 |
| | [2] Family Purpose Doctrine | 3-68 |
| | [3] Parental-Immunity Doctrine | 3-69 |
| § 3.15 | Economic Loss Doctrine | 3-71 |
| | [1] Definition of “Economic Loss” | 3-71 |
| | [2] Purpose of Economic Loss Doctrine..... | 3-72 |
| | [3] History of Economic Loss Doctrine | 3-73 |
| | [4] Minority Rule..... | 3-74 |
| | [5] Majority Rule..... | 3-75 |
| | [6] Intermediate Rule | 3-76 |
| | [7] “Other Property” Exception | 3-77 |
| | [8] Warranties..... | 3-78 |
| | [9] Economic Loss Doctrine in Wisconsin..... | 3-79 |
| | [a] Generally..... | 3-79 |
| | [b] First Recognized..... | 3-79 |
| | [c] “Other Property” Exception..... | 3-80 |
| | [d] Component Parts | 3-81 |
| | [e] Asbestos Exception | 3-82 |

| | | |
|--------|--|------|
| | [f] Privity | 3-82 |
| | [g] Consumer Transactions | 3-82 |
| | [h] Public Policy Exception | 3-83 |
| | [i] Fraud and Misrepresentation | 3-83 |
| | [j] Service Contract versus Product | 3-85 |
| § 3.16 | Multiple Claims in Excess of Liability Limits | 3-86 |
| | [1] First Come, First Served Approach | 3-86 |
| | [2] First to Judgment Approach | 3-87 |
| | [3] Pro Rata Approach | 3-87 |
| | [4] Good Faith, Bad Faith Approach | 3-87 |
| | [5] Interpleader | 3-88 |
| § 3.17 | Interstate Subrogation and Conflict of Laws | 3-88 |
| | [1] Interstate Subrogation | 3-88 |
| | [2] Conflict of Laws | 3-89 |
| § 3.18 | Subrogation and Fair Debt Collection Practices | 3-93 |
| | [1] Federal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act (FDCPA) | 3-93 |
| | [2] State Law—Consumer Protection Acts | 3-99 |

CHAPTER 4
AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES

| | | |
|--------|----------------------------|-------|
| | Introduction | 4-1 |
| § 4.01 | Alabama | 4-3 |
| § 4.02 | Alaska | 4-33 |
| § 4.03 | Arizona | 4-51 |
| § 4.04 | Arkansas | 4-73 |
| § 4.05 | California | 4-97 |
| § 4.06 | Colorado | 4-131 |
| § 4.07 | Connecticut | 4-163 |
| § 4.08 | Delaware | 4-183 |
| § 4.09 | District of Columbia | 4-209 |
| § 4.10 | Florida | 4-227 |
| § 4.11 | Georgia | 4-263 |
| § 4.12 | Hawaii | 4-295 |
| § 4.13 | Idaho | 4-331 |
| § 4.14 | Illinois | 4-349 |
| § 4.15 | Indiana | 4-377 |
| § 4.16 | Iowa | 4-405 |
| § 4.17 | Kansas | 4-429 |
| § 4.18 | Kentucky | 4-451 |
| § 4.19 | Louisiana | 4-481 |
| § 4.20 | Maine | 4-507 |
| § 4.21 | Maryland | 4-527 |
| § 4.22 | Massachusetts | 4-547 |
| § 4.23 | Michigan | 4-571 |
| § 4.24 | Minnesota | 4-603 |
| § 4.25 | Mississippi | 4-631 |
| § 4.26 | Missouri | 4-647 |
| § 4.27 | Montana | 4-669 |
| § 4.28 | Nebraska | 4-687 |

| | | |
|--------|----------------------|--------|
| § 4.29 | Nevada | 4-707 |
| § 4.30 | New Hampshire | 4-723 |
| § 4.31 | New Jersey..... | 4-739 |
| § 4.32 | New Mexico | 4-771 |
| § 4.33 | New York | 4-787 |
| § 4.34 | North Carolina | 4-825 |
| § 4.35 | North Dakota | 4-843 |
| § 4.36 | Ohio | 4-865 |
| § 4.37 | Oklahoma | 4-883 |
| § 4.38 | Oregon..... | 4-901 |
| § 4.39 | Pennsylvania | 4-923 |
| § 4.40 | Rhode Island | 4-945 |
| § 4.41 | South Carolina | 4-959 |
| § 4.42 | South Dakota | 4-975 |
| § 4.43 | Tennessee..... | 4-989 |
| § 4.44 | Texas..... | 4-1007 |
| § 4.45 | Utah | 4-1035 |
| § 4.46 | Vermont..... | 4-1053 |
| § 4.47 | Virginia..... | 4-1067 |
| § 4.48 | Washington..... | 4-1085 |
| § 4.49 | West Virginia | 4-1107 |
| § 4.50 | Wisconsin..... | 4-1129 |
| § 4.51 | Wyoming..... | 4-1161 |

**CHAPTER 5
SUSPENSION OF DRIVER LICENSES**

| | | |
|---------------------------------|---|-------|
| § 5.01 | Generally..... | 5-1 |
| § 5.02 | Driver’s License: Privilege or Right | 5-2 |
| § 5.03 | Suspending Driver Licenses in All 50 States | 5-4 |
| Table of Cases | | TC-1 |
| Table of Statutes..... | | TS-1 |
| Table of Other Authorities..... | | TOA-1 |

Gary L. Wickert
MATTHIESEN, WICKERT & LEHRER, S.C.
P.O. Box 270670
Hartford, WI 53027
(262) 673-7850
(262) 673-3766 (Fax)
gwickert@mw-law.com
www.mw-law.com