

ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES (FOURTH EDITION)

AUTHOR: GARY L. WICKERT, MATTHIESEN, WICKERT & LEHRER, S.C.

PUBLISHER: JURIS PUBLISHING, INC., NEW YORK, NEW YORK

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments.....	xvii
About the Author.....	xix
Notice.....	xxi
How to Use This Book.....	xxiii
Introduction.....	xxvii

CHAPTER 1

SUBROGATION GENERALLY

§ 1.01 Elements.....	1-1
§ 1.02 Origins of Subrogation.....	1-3
§ 1.03 Types of Subrogation.....	1-5
[1] Contractual (Conventional) Subrogation.....	1-6
[2] Equitable (Legal) Subrogation.....	1-7
[a] Difference between Subrogation and Assignment.....	1-8
[b] Roles of Equity.....	1-9
[3] Statutory Subrogation.....	1-15
[a] Workers' Compensation.....	1-15
[b] Hospital Liens.....	1-18
[c] Medicare.....	1-19
[d] Medicaid.....	1-23
[e] Interplay between Workers' Compensation and Medicare/Medicaid.....	1-29
[f] Federal Employees Health Benefit Act (FEHBA).....	1-31
[g] Other Statutory Subrogation.....	1-31
§ 1.04 Purposes of Subrogation.....	1-31
§ 1.05 Anti-Subrogation Arguments.....	1-33

CHAPTER 2

INSURED ERISA-COVERED EMPLOYEE WELFARE BENEFIT PLANS

§ 2.01 Generally.....	2-2
§ 2.02 Types of Health Plans.....	2-4
[1] Indemnity Plans.....	2-5

	[2] Preferred Provider Organization (PPO)	2-5
	[3] Health Maintenance Organization (HMO).....	2-6
	[4] Individual Practice Association (IPA)	2-7
	[5] Point-of-Service Plan (POS)	2-7
§ 2.03	Multiple Employer Plans	2-7
	[1] Single-Employer Plans	2-7
	[2] Multi-Employer Plans.....	2-8
	[3] Multiple-Employer Welfare Association Plans (MEWA)	2-10
	[4] Voluntary Employees' Beneficiary Association (VEBA)	2-18
§ 2.04	Subrogation and Reimbursement Rights	2-20
	[1] Subrogation Rights	2-21
	[2] Reimbursement Rights	2-23
	[3] Standing in the Shoes of the Insured.....	2-24
	[4] Indemnity versus Investment Contracts.....	2-25
	[5] No Multiple Recoveries.....	2-27
	[6] Subrogation Arises with Payment.....	2-28
	[7] Subrogation against Municipalities	2-28
§ 2.05	Requirement to Join Subrogated Party.....	2-28
	[1] Wis. Stat. § 803.03—Claims Arising by Subrogation.....	2-29
	[2] Is the Subrogated Party a Plaintiff, Defendant or Other?	2-30
	[3] The Reverse—Must Subrogated Party Join the Insured?	2-30
	[4] The Need to Participate	2-31
	[5] What Do You Do If You Are Not Joined?	2-31
§ 2.06	Notice to Subrogated Parties.....	2-32
§ 2.07	What Happens If the Plaintiff Loses at Trial?	2-33
§ 2.08	Made Whole Doctrine and Non-ERISA Health Plans	2-34
	[1] Garrity v. Rural Mutual Ins. Co.	2-36
	[2] Rimes v. State Farm Mutual Auto Ins. Co... ..	2-36
	[3] What Does It Mean to Be “Made Whole”?	2-38
	[a] Basic Test	2-38
	[b] Contributory Negligence	2-38
	[4] All Damages	2-46
	[5] Attorney’s Fees.....	2-46
	[6] Where Plan Specifically Negates Made Whole Doctrine	2-47
§ 2.09	Common Fund Doctrine and Non-ERISA Health Plans.....	2-54
§ 2.10	Statute of Limitations Issues.....	2-56
§ 2.11	Indemnification Agreements	2-57
§ 2.12	Subrogated Party on the Settlement Check: Is It Enough?	2-58
§ 2.13	Subrogating against Under/Uninsured Motorist Carriers	2-59
	[1] “...A Responsible Third Party...”	2-59
	[2] “...Any Party Who May Be Liable...”	2-60
	[3] “...Caused, or Is Liable for...”	2-60
	[4] Collateral Source Rules	2-61
	[5] Anti-Subrogation Laws	2-64
	[6] Summary	2-65

CHAPTER 3

HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES

Introduction	3-1
§ 3.01 Alabama	3-3
§ 3.02 Alaska	3-15
§ 3.03 Arizona	3-23
§ 3.04 Arkansas	3-27
§ 3.05 California	3-31
§ 3.06 Colorado	3-49
§ 3.07 Connecticut	3-55
§ 3.08 Delaware	3-61
§ 3.09 District of Columbia	3-65
§ 3.10 Florida	3-69
§ 3.11 Georgia	3-77
§ 3.12 Hawai'i	3-89
§ 3.13 Idaho	3-95
§ 3.14 Illinois	3-101
§ 3.15 Indiana	3-111
§ 3.16 Iowa	3-119
§ 3.17 Kansas	3-125
§ 3.18 Kentucky	3-133
§ 3.19 Louisiana	3-141
§ 3.20 Maine	3-151
§ 3.21 Maryland	3-157
§ 3.22 Massachusetts	3-165
§ 3.23 Michigan	3-173
§ 3.24 Minnesota	3-183
§ 3.25 Mississippi	3-191
§ 3.26 Missouri	3-195
§ 3.27 Montana	3-199
§ 3.28 Nebraska	3-209
§ 3.29 Nevada	3-215
§ 3.30 New Hampshire	3-221
§ 3.31 New Jersey	3-225
§ 3.32 New Mexico	3-235
§ 3.33 New York	3-241
§ 3.34 North Carolina	3-257
§ 3.35 North Dakota	3-263
§ 3.36 Ohio	3-267
§ 3.37 Oklahoma	3-279
§ 3.38 Oregon	3-285
§ 3.39 Pennsylvania	3-293
§ 3.40 Rhode Island	3-305
§ 3.41 South Carolina	3-309
§ 3.42 South Dakota	3-315
§ 3.43 Tennessee	3-319
§ 3.44 Texas	3-327
§ 3.45 Utah	3-339

§ 3.46	Vermont	3-345
§ 3.47	Virginia	3-349
§ 3.48	Washington	3-355
§ 3.49	West Virginia	3-361
§ 3.50	Wisconsin.....	3-367
§ 3.51	Wyoming.....	3-385

CHAPTER 4

SELF-FUNDED, ERISA-COVERED EMPLOYEE MEDICAL BENEFIT PLAN SUBROGATION

§ 4.01	Introduction to ERISA	4-2
	[1] History of ERISA.....	4-2
	[2] Background	4-3
	[3] Enactment and Purpose	4-5
	[4] Scope of ERISA.....	4-6
	[5] Definitions—The Language of ERISA	4-7
	[6] Trust, Contract, and Labor Law Parallels	4-9
	[a] Trust Law.....	4-9
	[b] Contract Law	4-11
	[c] Labor Law.....	4-12
	[7] Federal Common Law	4-12
§ 4.02	What Is an ERISA Plan?	4-14
	[1] Self-Funded Plans versus Insured Plans.....	4-16
	[2] Stop-Loss Coverage.....	4-22
	[3] General Rule to Determine Whether Plan Is ERISA-Covered	4-28
	[4] Safe Harbor Regulations	4-32
	[5] Plans Not Subject to ERISA	4-34
	[a] Government Plans and Church Plans	4-34
	[b] Trade Association Plans and Employees' Beneficiary Associations.....	4-36
	[c] Plans That Cover Owners and Not Employees	4-39
	[d] Multi-Employer Plans.....	4-39
	[e] Entities Not Engaged in Interstate Commerce.....	4-41
	[f] Subrogating Insured ERISA-Covered Plans.....	4-41
	[6] Other Plans Subject to ERISA	4-41
	[a] HMO Plans	4-41
	[b] Plans Administered by Employer.....	4-42
	[c] Occupational Accident Plans.....	4-42
	[7] What Constitutes the Plan?	4-47
	[a] Coverage Booklet.....	4-47
	[b] Summary Plan Description (SPD)	4-47
	[c] Wrap Documents.....	4-48

CHAPTER 5

ERISA PREEMPTION

§ 5.01	Preemption, Saving and Deemer Clauses.....	5-2
	[1] Preemption Clause	5-4
	[2] Saving Clause	5-8

	[3] Deemer Clause.....	5-10
§ 5.02	Two Types of Preemption—Complete and Conflict.....	5-14
	[1] Complete Preemption (Narrow Preemption).....	5-16
	[2] Conflict Preemption (Broad Preemption).....	5-20
§ 5.03	ERISA Preemption of State Law Where Plan Is Insured and Not “Self-Funded”.....	5-23
§ 5.04	When Does State Law “Relate to” an Employee Benefit Plan?.....	5-25
§ 5.05	When Does State Law “Regulate Insurance”?.....	5-30
§ 5.06	Preemption of State Court Judgments and Orders.....	5-37
§ 5.07	Erosion of Preemption.....	5-38

CHAPTER 6

ERISA AND THE MADE WHOLE DOCTRINE

§ 6.01	Introduction.....	6-2
§ 6.02	Made Whole Doctrine as Default Rule.....	6-3
§ 6.03	Applied to Self-Funded Plans.....	6-4
§ 6.04	Doctrine Affected by Reimbursement Provision.....	6-10
§ 6.05	Presumption against Made Whole Doctrine.....	6-12
§ 6.06	Made Whole Doctrine as Gap Filler.....	6-13
§ 6.07	Effect of Plan Administrator’s Interpretation.....	6-13
§ 6.08	Made Whole Doctrine Applicable unless Specifically Negated by Plan Language....	6-14
§ 6.09	Made Whole Doctrine under Federal Common Law.....	6-19
§ 6.10	Definition of Made Whole.....	6-20
§ 6.11	Where Beneficiary Violates Plan’s Cooperation Clause.....	6-22
§ 6.12	Made Whole Doctrine Doesn’t Affect Other Duties under Plan.....	6-22
§ 6.13	Effect of Exclusionary/Excess Language.....	6-23
§ 6.14	Examples of Specific Plan Language.....	6-24
§ 6.15	Treatment of Made Whole Doctrine by Circuit.....	6-26
	[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI).....	6-26
	[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT).....	6-27
	[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands).....	6-27
	[4] Fourth Circuit (MD, NC, SC, VA, WV).....	6-27
	[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX).....	6-28
	[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN).....	6-28
	[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI).....	6-32
	[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD).....	6-33
	[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands) ..	6-35
	[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY).....	6-37
	[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA).....	6-38
	[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia).....	6-40

CHAPTER 7

ERISA AND THE COMMON FUND DOCTRINE

§ 7.01	Introduction.....	7-2
§ 7.02	Plan Language: “Out of Any Monies Recovered” and “All Rights of Recovery”.....	7-3
§ 7.03	“Full Reimbursement” Language.....	7-4
§ 7.04	Absence of Language Exempting Common Fund Doctrine.....	7-4

§ 7.05	Plan Language Clearly Exempts Common Fund Doctrine	7-10
§ 7.06	Effect of Plan Administrator’s Interpretation	7-12
§ 7.07	Common Fund Doctrine under Federal Common Law	7-12
§ 7.08	Hourly or Contingency Fee?	7-14
§ 7.09	Notice of Litigation Requirement.....	7-15
§ 7.10	Who May Raise a Common Fund Claim?	7-16
§ 7.11	Treatment of Common Fund Doctrine by Circuit	7-17
	[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI)	7-18
	[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT).....	7-19
	[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands)	7-19
	[4] Fourth Circuit (MD, NC, SC, VA, WV)	7-19
	[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX).....	7-20
	[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN)	7-20
	[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI)	7-21
	[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD)	7-22
	[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands) ..	7-23
	[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY).....	7-23
	[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA)	7-24
	[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia).....	7-26

CHAPTER 8

RIGHTS OF RECOVERY: SUBROGATION AND REIMBURSEMENT

§ 8.01	Introduction.....	8-2
§ 8.02	Persons Who Can Pursue Subrogation.....	8-3
§ 8.03	Venue	8-7
§ 8.04	Parties Authorized to Bring Action	8-9
§ 8.05	Jurisdiction	8-11
§ 8.06	Removal	8-17
§ 8.07	Problem Circuits	8-26
§ 8.08	Abstention	8-29
§ 8.09	Intervention	8-30
	[1] State Court	8-30
	[2] Federal Court.....	8-34
§ 8.10	ERISA Statutory Authority Subrogation Enforcement.....	8-35
§ 8.11	Rights of Recovery: Subrogation and Reimbursement.....	8-36
	[1] Recovery Rights Generally	8-36
	[2] Plan Language Determines Subrogation Rights.....	8-38
	[3] Recovery Rights under ERISA	8-39
	[4] Types of Recovery Provisions	8-40
	[a] Subrogation Provisions.....	8-40
	[b] Reimbursement Provisions.....	8-41
	[c] Exclusionary Provisions.....	8-42
	[d] No Subrogation Language.....	8-43
	[5] Subrogation Receipts and Reimbursement Agreements.....	8-44
	[a] Subrogation Agreement Does Not Control	8-45
	[b] Subrogation Agreement Does Control.....	8-46

[6]	Recovery Priorities	8-49
	[a] Elements of Damages Recovered.....	8-49
	[b] Allocation of Recovery among Beneficiaries	8-59
	[c] First Money Recovered	8-64
	[d] Subrogating for More Than Benefits Paid.....	8-64
	[e] Gray Areas	8-65
	[f] Causation	8-65
[7]	Reimbursement Rights	8-68
[8]	Sample ERISA Plan Subrogation Language	8-70
[9]	Sue in the Name of Plan or Third Party Administrator?	8-71
[10]	Credit against Future Benefits	8-72
[11]	Summary Plan Description (SPD)	8-79
[12]	Summary Plan Description as Formal Plan Document.....	8-84
[13]	Plan Fiduciary’s Interpretation of Plan Language	8-88
[14]	Multiple Plan Documents–Conflicting Terms	8-94
[15]	Purpose of ERISA Subrogation	8-96
§ 8.12	Injunctions	8-97
§ 8.13	Constructive Trusts and Equitable Liens	8-98
§ 8.14	Restitution	8-102
§ 8.15	Declaratory Judgment Actions.....	8-108
§ 8.16	What Constitutes “Appropriate Equitable Relief”?	8-112
§ 8.17	Early Decisions.....	8-116

CHAPTER 9

SUPREME COURT DECISIONS AFFECTING ERISA REIMBURSEMENT: *KNUDSON AND SEREBOFF*

§ 9.01	<i>Great West Life & Annuity Ins. Co. v. Knudson</i>	9-1
§ 9.02	Why the Supreme Court Got It Wrong in <i>Knudson</i>	9-5
§ 9.03	<i>Sereboff v. Mid Atlantic Medical Services, L.L.C.</i>	9-8
§ 9.04	Applying <i>Knudson</i> and <i>Sereboff</i> to ERISA Subrogation.....	9-12
§ 9.05	Treatment of <i>Knudson</i> by Circuit.....	9-15
	[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI).....	9-17
	[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT)	9-19
	[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands)	9-21
	[4] Fourth Circuit (MD, NC, SC, VA, WV)	9-23
	[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX)	9-26
	[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN).....	9-28
	[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI).....	9-30
	[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD).....	9-32
	[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands) ..	9-36
	[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY)	9-39
	[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA)	9-39
	[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia)	9-45
§ 9.06	Summary of Supreme Court Treatment of “Appropriate Equitable Relief”	9-47
§ 9.07	Possible Congressional Action to Remedy <i>Knudson</i>	9-51

CHAPTER 10

OTHER ERISA RECOVERY ISSUES

§ 10.01	Medical Malpractice Recoveries	10-2
§ 10.02	Uninsured Motorist Benefits.....	10-3
§ 10.03	Med Pay and PIP Benefits	10-15
§ 10.04	No-Fault Insurance Laws	10-16
§ 10.05	Anti-Subrogation Laws.....	10-18
§ 10.06	“Regulation of Insurance” Test.....	10-24
§ 10.07	Lien Reduction Statutes.....	10-26
§ 10.08	Common Fund Doctrine Statutes.....	10-26
§ 10.09	State Collateral Source Rules.....	10-31
§ 10.10	Federal Employees Health Benefit Act (FEHBA)	10-37
§ 10.11	Other State Statutes	10-45
§ 10.12	Federal Common Law.....	10-46
§ 10.13	Laws regarding Minors.....	10-48
§ 10.14	Recovery of Benefit Payments Made by Mistake.....	10-49
	[1] Mistake of Fact.....	10-51
	[2] Mistake of Law	10-52
	[3] Overpayment of Benefits (Social Security)	10-52
§ 10.15	Coordination of Benefits (COB)	10-56
§ 10.16	NAIC Group Coordination of Benefits Model Regulation	10-73
§ 10.17	HIPAA, HITECH, Medical Privacy, and Subrogation	10-76
	[1] The Problem: Medical Record Privacy.....	10-76
	[2] The Solutions: HIPAA’s and HITECH’s Privacy Regulations	10-77
	[3] HIPAA’s and HITECH’s Impact on Subrogation.....	10-78
	[4] The Federal Services Modernization Act (FSMA).....	10-81
	[5] Summary	10-83
§ 10.18	Overlap with Workers’ Compensation.....	10-83
§ 10.19	Attorney’s Fees.....	10-96
§ 10.20	Choice-of-Law Provisions	10-101
§ 10.21	Statutes of Limitations.....	10-102
§ 10.22	Right to Jury Trial.....	10-104
§ 10.23	Equitable Estoppel.....	10-104
§ 10.24	Bankruptcy	10-104
§ 10.25	Bad Faith	10-114

CHAPTER 11

ENFORCEMENT OF REIMBURSEMENT RIGHTS AFTER SETTLEMENT

§ 11.01	Introduction.....	11-1
§ 11.02	Federal Court Jurisdiction.....	11-2
§ 11.03	Unjust Enrichment	11-3
§ 11.04	Effect of Release of Third Party by Participant	11-7
§ 11.05	Tortious Interference	11-9
§ 11.06	Conversion	11-10
§ 11.07	Equitable Lien by Agreement	11-11

§ 11.08	Implied Partnership.....	11-12
§ 11.09	Breach of Fiduciary Duty	11-14
§ 11.10	Breach of Contract.....	11-15
§ 11.11	State Court Jurisdiction after <i>Knudson</i> and <i>Sereboff</i>	11-23
	[1] Narrow View.....	11-26
	[2] Broad View.....	11-28
	[3] Modern View	11-28
§ 11.12	Plaintiffs' Attorneys' Ethical Considerations.....	11-29
§ 11.13	Special Needs Trusts	11-30

CHAPTER 12
IMPROVING PLAN LANGUAGE

CHAPTER 13
HIRING SUBROGATION COUNSEL

APPENDICES

A-1	Wis. Stat. § 803.03 – <i>Joinder of Persons Needed for Just and Complete Adjudication</i> ..	A-1
A-2	29 U.S.C. § 1102 – <i>Establishment of Plan</i>	A-5
A-3	Bad ERISA Plan Subrogation Language	A-7
A-4	Good ERISA Plan Subrogation Language.....	A-9
A-5	29 U.S.C. § 1003 – <i>Coverage</i>	A-13
A-6	29 U.S.C. § 1144 – <i>Other laws</i>	A-15
A-7	Geographic Boundaries of United States Courts of Appeals and United States District Courts.....	A-21
A-8	29 U.S.C. § 1132 – <i>Civil enforcement</i>	A-23
A-9	28 U.S.C. § 1331 – <i>Federal question</i>	A-33
A-10	Form 5500 – Annual Return/Report of Employee Benefit Plan	A-35
A-11	<i>Sereboff v. Mid Atlantic Medical Service, Inc.</i>	A-39
A-12	<i>Great-West Life & Annuity Ins. Co. v. Knudson</i>	A-53
A-13	Curriculum Vitae of Gary L. Wickert	A-83
	Table of Cases.....	TC-1
	Table of Statutes.....	TS-1
	Table of Other Authorities	TOA-1