

**ERISA AND HEALTH INSURANCE IN ALL 50 STATES
(THIRD EDITION)**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	iii
About the Author	v
Notice	vii
How to Use this Book	ix
Table of Contents	xiii
Introduction	xxvii

CHAPTER 1

SUBROGATION GENERALLY

§ 1.01	Elements	1-1
§ 1.02	Origins of Subrogation	1-3
§ 1.03	Types of Subrogation	1-5
	[1] Contractual (Conventional) Subrogation	1-6
	[2] Equitable (Legal) Subrogation	1-7
	[a] Difference between Subrogation and Assignment	1-8
	[b] Roles of Equity	1-9
	[3] Statutory Subrogation	1-15
	[a] Workers' Compensation	1-16
	[b] Hospital Liens	1-18
	[c] Medicare	1-19
	[d] Medicaid	1-23
	[e] Interplay between Workers' Compensation and Medicare/Medicaid	1-27
	[f] Federal Employees Health Benefit Act (FEHBA)	1-29
	[g] Other Statutory Subrogation	1-29
§ 1.04	Purposes of Subrogation	1-30
§ 1.05	Anti-Subrogation Arguments	1-32

CHAPTER 2

INSURED ERISA-COVERED EMPLOYEE WELFARE BENEFIT PLANS

§ 2.01	Generally	2-2
§ 2.02	Types of Health Plans	2-4
	[1] Indemnity Plans	2-5
	[2] Preferred Provider Organization (PPO)	2-5
	[3] Health Maintenance Organization (HMO)	2-6
	[4] Individual Practice Association (IPA)	2-7
	[5] Point-of-Service Plan (POS)	2-7
§ 2.03	Multiple Employer Plans	2-7
	[1] Single-Employer Plans	2-7
	[2] Multi-Employer Plans	2-8
	[3] Multiple-Employer Plans (MEWAs)	2-10
§ 2.04	Subrogation and Reimbursement Rights	2-17
	[1] Subrogation Rights	2-18
	[2] Reimbursement Rights	2-20
	[3] Standing in the Shoes of the Insured	2-21

	[4] Indemnity versus Investment Contracts	2-22
	[5] No Multiple Recoveries	2-24
	[6] Subrogation Arises with Payment	2-25
	[7] Subrogation against Municipalities	2-25
§ 2.05	Requirement to Join Subrogated Party	2-25
	[1] Wis. Stat. § 803.03—Claims Arising by Subrogation	2-26
	[2] Is the Subrogated Party a Plaintiff, Defendant or Other?	2-27
	[3] The Reverse—Must Subrogated Party Join the Insured?	2-28
	[4] The Need to Participate	2-28
	[5] What Do You Do If You Are Not Joined?	2-28
§ 2.06	Notice to Subrogated Parties	2-29
§ 2.07	What Happens If the Plaintiff Loses at Trial?	2-30
§ 2.08	Made Whole Doctrine and Non-ERISA Health Plans	2-31
	[1] <i>Garrity v. Rural Mutual Ins. Co.</i>	2-33
	[2] <i>Rimes v. State Farm Mutual Auto Ins. Co.</i>	2-33
	[3] What Does It Mean to Be “Made Whole”?	2-35
	[a] Basic Test	2-35
	[b] Contributory Negligence	2-35
	[4] All Damages	2-43
	[5] Attorney’s Fees	2-44
	[6] Where Plan Specifically Negates Made Whole Doctrine	2-44
§ 2.09	Common Fund Doctrine and Non-ERISA Health Plans	2-52
§ 2.10	Statute of Limitations Issues	2-53
§ 2.11	Indemnification Agreements	2-54
§ 2.12	Subrogated Party on the Settlement Check: Is It Enough?	2-55
§ 2.13	Subrogating against Under/Uninsured Motorist Carriers	2-56
	[1] “...A Responsible Third Party...”	2-56
	[2] “...Any Party Who May Be Liable...”	2-57
	[3] “...Caused, or Is Liable for...”	2-58
	[4] Collateral Source Rules	2-58
	[5] Anti-Subrogation Laws	2-61
	[6] Summary	2-63

CHAPTER 3

HEALTH INSURANCE SUBROGATION IN ALL 50 STATES

Introduction	3-1
§ 3.01 Alabama	3-3
§ 3.02 Alaska	3-15
§ 3.03 Arizona	3-21
§ 3.04 Arkansas	3-25
§ 3.05 California	3-29
§ 3.06 Colorado	3-47
§ 3.07 Connecticut	3-51
§ 3.08 Delaware	3-57
§ 3.09 District of Columbia	3-61
§ 3.10 Florida	3-65
§ 3.11 Georgia	3-73
§ 3.12 Hawai’i	3-83
§ 3.13 Idaho	3-89
§ 3.14 Illinois	3-95
§ 3.15 Indiana	3-105

§ 3.16	Iowa	3-113
§ 3.17	Kansas	3-119
§ 3.18	Kentucky	3-127
§ 3.19	Louisiana	3-133
§ 3.20	Maine	3-143
§ 3.21	Maryland	3-149
§ 3.22	Massachusetts	3-157
§ 3.23	Michigan	3-165
§ 3.24	Minnesota	3-175
§ 3.25	Mississippi	3-183
§ 3.26	Missouri	3-187
§ 3.27	Montana	3-191
§ 3.28	Nebraska	3-199
§ 3.29	Nevada	3-205
§ 3.30	New Hampshire	3-211
§ 3.31	New Jersey	3-215
§ 3.32	New Mexico	3-225
§ 3.33	New York	3-231
§ 3.34	North Carolina	3-245
§ 3.35	North Dakota	3-251
§ 3.36	Ohio	3-255
§ 3.37	Oklahoma	3-263
§ 3.38	Oregon	3-269
§ 3.39	Pennsylvania	3-275
§ 3.40	Rhode Island	3-285
§ 3.41	South Carolina	3-289
§ 3.42	South Dakota	3-295
§ 3.43	Tennessee	3-299
§ 3.44	Texas	3-307
§ 3.45	Utah	3-319
§ 3.46	Vermont	3-325
§ 3.47	Virginia	3-329
§ 3.48	Washington	3-335
§ 3.49	West Virginia	3-341
§ 3.50	Wisconsin	3-345
§ 3.51	Wyoming	3-363

CHAPTER 4

SELF-FUNDED, ERISA-COVERED EMPLOYEE MEDICAL BENEFIT PLAN SUBROGATION

§ 4.01	Introduction to ERISA	4-2
	[1] History of ERISA	4-2
	[2] Background	4-3
	[3] Enactment and Purpose	4-5
	[4] Scope of ERISA	4-6
	[5] Definitions—The Language of ERISA	4-7
	[6] Trust, Contract, and Labor Law Parallels	4-9
	[a] Trust Law	4-9
	[b] Contract Law	4-11
	[c] Labor Law	4-12
	[7] Federal Common Law	4-12
§ 4.02	What Is an ERISA Plan?	4-14
	[1] Self-Funded Plans versus Insured Plans	4-16

[2] Stop-Loss Coverage	4-19
[3] General Rule to Determine Whether Plan Is ERISA-Covered	4-25
[4] Safe Harbor Regulations	4-29
[5] Plans Not Subject to ERISA	4-31
[a] Government Plans and Church Plans	4-32
[b] Trade Association Plans and Employees' Beneficiary Associations	4-33
[c] Plans That Cover Owners and Not Employees	4-36
[d] Multi-Employer Plans	4-36
[e] Entities Not Engaged in Interstate Commerce	4-38
[f] Subrogating Insured ERISA-Covered Plans	4-38
[6] Other Plans Subject to ERISA	4-39
[a] HMO Plans	4-39
[b] Plans Administered by Employer	4-39
[c] Occupational Accident Plans	4-40
[7] What Constitutes the Plan?	4-44
[a] Coverage Booklet	4-44
[b] Summary Plan Description (SPD)	4-45
[c] Wrap Documents	4-45

CHAPTER 5

ERISA PREEMPTION

§ 5.01	Preemption, Saving and Deemer Clauses	5-2
	[1] Preemption Clause	5-4
	[2] Saving Clause	5-8
	[3] Deemer Clause	5-10
§ 5.02	Two Types of Preemption—Complete and Conflict	5-14
	[1] Complete Preemption (Narrow Preemption)	5-16
	[2] Conflict Preemption (Broad Preemption)	5-20
§ 5.03	ERISA Preemption of State Law Where Plan Is Insured and Not “Self-Funded”	5-24
§ 5.04	When Does State Law “Relate to” an Employee Benefit Plan?	5-25
§ 5.05	When Does State Law “Regulate Insurance”?	5-30
§ 5.06	Erosion of Preemption	5-37

CHAPTER 6

ERISA AND THE MADE WHOLE DOCTRINE

§ 6.01	Introduction	6-2
§ 6.02	Made Whole Doctrine as Default Rule	6-3
§ 6.03	Applied to Self-Funded Plans	6-4
§ 6.04	Doctrine Affected by Reimbursement Provision	6-10
§ 6.05	Presumption against Made Whole Doctrine	6-12
§ 6.06	Made Whole Doctrine as Gap Filler	6-13
§ 6.07	Effect of Plan Administrator's Interpretation	6-13
§ 6.08	Made Whole Doctrine Applicable unless Specifically Negated by Plan Language	6-14
§ 6.09	Made Whole Doctrine under Federal Common Law	6-19
§ 6.10	Definition of Made Whole	6-20
§ 6.11	Where Beneficiary Violates Plan's Cooperation Clause	6-22
§ 6.12	Made Whole Doctrine Doesn't Affect Other Duties under Plan	6-22
§ 6.13	Effect of Exclusionary/Excess Language	6-23
§ 6.14	Examples of Specific Plan Language	6-24
§ 6.15	Treatment of Made Whole Doctrine by Circuit	6-25
	[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI)	6-26

[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT)	6-26
[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands)	6-27
[4] Fourth Circuit (MD, NC, SC, VA, WV)	6-27
[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX)	6-27
[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN)	6-28
[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI)	6-29
[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD)	6-30
[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands)	6-32
[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY)	6-34
[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA)	6-35
[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia)	6-37

CHAPTER 7

ERISA AND THE COMMON FUND DOCTRINE

§ 7.01	Introduction	7-2
§ 7.02	Plan Language: “Out of Any Monies Recovered” and “All Rights of Recovery”	7-3
§ 7.03	“Full Reimbursement” Language	7-4
§ 7.04	Absence of Language Exempting Common Fund Doctrine	7-4
§ 7.05	Plan Language Clearly Exempts Common Fund Doctrine	7-10
§ 7.06	Effect of Plan Administrator’s Interpretation	7-12
§ 7.07	Common Fund Doctrine under Federal Common Law	7-12
§ 7.08	Hourly or Contingency Fee?	7-14
§ 7.09	Notice of Litigation Requirement	7-15
§ 7.10	Who May Raise a Common Fund Claim?	7-16
§ 7.11	Treatment of Common Fund Doctrine by Circuit	7-17
	[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI)	7-18
	[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT)	7-19
	[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands)	7-19
	[4] Fourth Circuit (MD, NC, SC, VA, WV)	7-19
	[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX)	7-20
	[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN)	7-20
	[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI)	7-21
	[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD)	7-22
	[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands)	7-23
	[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY)	7-23
	[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA)	7-24
	[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia)	7-24

CHAPTER 8

RIGHTS OF RECOVERY: SUBROGATION AND REIMBURSEMENT

§ 8.01	Introduction	8-2
§ 8.02	Persons Who Can Pursue Subrogation	8-3
§ 8.03	Venue	8-6
§ 8.04	Parties Authorized to Bring Action	8-9
§ 8.05	Jurisdiction	8-11
§ 8.06	Removal	8-17
§ 8.07	Problem Circuits	8-26
§ 8.08	Abstention	8-28
§ 8.09	Intervention	8-30
	[1] State Court	8-30
	[2] Federal Court	8-33

§ 8.10	ERISA Statutory Authority Subrogation Enforcement	8-35
§ 8.11	Rights of Recovery: Subrogation and Reimbursement	8-36
	[1] Recovery Rights Generally	8-36
	[2] Plan Language Determines Subrogation Rights	8-38
	[3] Recovery Rights under ERISA	8-38
	[4] Types of Recovery Provisions	8-39
	[a] Subrogation Provisions	8-40
	[b] Reimbursement Provisions	8-41
	[c] Exclusionary Provisions	8-41
	[d] No Subrogation Language	8-43
	[5] Subrogation Receipts and Reimbursement Agreements	8-44
	[a] Subrogation Agreement Does Not Control	8-44
	[b] Subrogation Agreement Does Control	8-46
	[6] Recovery Priorities	8-49
	[a] Elements of Damages Recovered	8-49
	[b] Allocation of Recovery among Beneficiaries	8-59
	[c] First Money Recovered	8-62
	[d] Subrogating for More Than Benefits Paid	8-63
	[e] Gray Areas	8-63
	[f] Causation	8-64
	[7] Reimbursement Rights	8-66
	[8] Sample ERISA Plan Subrogation Language	8-69
	[9] Sue in the Name of Plan or Third Party Administrator?	8-69
	[10] Credit against Future Benefits	8-70
	[11] Summary Plan Description (SPD)	8-78
	[12] Summary Plan Description as Formal Plan Document	8-82
	[13] Plan Fiduciary's Interpretation of Plan Language	8-87
	[14] Purpose of ERISA Subrogation	8-92
§ 8.12	Injunctions	8-92
§ 8.13	Constructive Trusts and Equitable Liens	8-93
§ 8.14	Restitution	8-97
§ 8.15	Declaratory Judgment Actions	8-103
§ 8.16	What Constitutes "Appropriate Equitable Relief"?	8-108
§ 8.17	Early Decisions	8-111

CHAPTER 9

SUPREME COURT DECISIONS AFFECTING ERISA REIMBURSEMENT:

KNUDSON AND SEREBOFF

§ 9.01	<i>Great West Life & Annuity Ins. Co. v. Knudson</i>	9-1
§ 9.02	Why the Supreme Court Got It Wrong in <i>Knudson</i>	9-5
§ 9.03	<i>Sereboff v. Mid Atlantic Medical Services, L.L.C.</i>	9-8
§ 9.04	Applying <i>Knudson</i> and <i>Sereboff</i> to ERISA Subrogation	9-12
§ 9.05	Treatment of <i>Knudson</i> by Circuit	9-15
	[1] First Circuit (ME, MA, NH, Puerto Rico, RI)	9-17
	[2] Second Circuit (NY, CT, VT)	9-18
	[3] Third Circuit (DE, NJ, PA, Virgin Islands)	9-21
	[4] Fourth Circuit (MA, NC, SC, VA, WV)	9-23
	[5] Fifth Circuit (LA, MS, TX)	9-26
	[6] Sixth Circuit (KY, MI, OH, TN)	9-28
	[7] Seventh Circuit (IL, IN, WI)	9-29
	[8] Eighth Circuit (AR, IA, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD)	9-31

	[9] Ninth Circuit (AK, AZ, CA, HI, ID, MT, NV, OR, WA, Guam, Mariana Islands)	9-35
	[10] Tenth Circuit (CO, KS, NM, OK, UT, WY)	9-38
	[11] Eleventh Circuit (AL, FL, GA)	9-39
	[12] D.C. Circuit (District of Columbia)	9-45
§ 9.06	Summary of Supreme Court Treatment of “Appropriate Equitable Relief”	9-46
§ 9.07	Possible Congressional Action to Remedy <i>Knudson</i>	9-50

CHAPTER 10

OTHER ERISA RECOVERY ISSUES

§ 10.01	Medical Malpractice Recoveries	10-2
§ 10.02	Uninsured Motorist Benefits	10-3
§ 10.03	Med Pay and PIP Benefits	10-14
§ 10.04	No-Fault Insurance Laws	10-15
§ 10.05	Anti-Subrogation Laws	10-17
§ 10.06	“Regulation of Insurance” Test	10-23
§ 10.07	Lien Reduction Statutes	10-24
§ 10.08	Common Fund Doctrine Statutes	10-25
§ 10.09	State Collateral Source Rules	10-30
§ 10.10	Federal Employees Health Benefit Act (FEHBA)	10-36
§ 10.11	Other State Statutes	10-43
§ 10.12	Federal Common Law	10-44
§ 10.13	Laws regarding Minors	10-46
§ 10.14	Recovery of Benefit Payments Made by Mistake	10-48
	[1] Mistake of Fact	10-48
	[2] Mistake of Law	10-50
	[3] Overpayment of Benefits (Social Security)	10-50
§ 10.15	Coordination of Benefits (COB)	10-52
§ 10.16	NAIC Group Coordination of Benefits Model Regulation	10-70
§ 10.17	HIPAA, Medical Privacy, and Subrogation	10-72
	[1] The Problem: Medical Record Privacy	10-73
	[2] The Solution: HIPAA’s Privacy Regulations	10-73
	[3] HIPAA’s Impact on Subrogation	10-74
	[4] The Federal Services Modernization Act (FSMA)	10-77
	[5] Summary	10-78
§ 10.18	Overlap with Workers’ Compensation	10-78
§ 10.19	Attorney’s Fees	10-86
§ 10.20	Choice-of-Law Provisions	10-91
§ 10.21	Statutes of Limitations	10-91
§ 10.22	Right to Jury Trial	10-93
§ 10.23	Equitable Estoppel	10-94
§ 10.24	Bankruptcy	10-94
§ 10.25	Bad Faith	10-103

CHAPTER 11

ENFORCEMENT OF REIMBURSEMENT RIGHTS AFTER SETTLEMENT

§ 11.01	Introduction	11-1
§ 11.02	Federal Court Jurisdiction	11-2
§ 11.03	Unjust Enrichment	11-2
§ 11.04	Effect of Release of Third Party by Participant	11-7
§ 11.05	Tortious Interference	11-9
§ 11.06	Implied Partnership	11-10

§ 11.07	Breach of Fiduciary Duty	11-11
§ 11.08	Breach of Contract	11-12
§ 11.09	State Court Jurisdiction after <i>Knudson</i> and <i>Sereboff</i>	11-19
	[1] Narrow View	11-23
	[2] Broad View	11-24
	[3] Modern View	11-25
§ 11.10	Plaintiffs' Attorneys' Ethical Considerations	11-26
§ 11.11	Special Needs Trusts	11-27

CHAPTER 12

IMPROVING PLAN LANGUAGE

CHAPTER 13

HIRING SUBROGATION COUNSEL

APPENDICES

A-1	Wis. Stat. § 803.03 – Joinder of Persons Needed for Just and Complete Adjudication	A-1
A-2	29 U.S.C. § 1102 – Establishment of Plan	A-5
A-3	Bad ERISA Plan Subrogation Language	A-7
A-4	Good ERISA Plan Subrogation Language	A-9
A-5	29 U.S.C. § 1003 – Coverage	A-13
A-6	29 U.S.C. § 1144 – Other Laws	A-15
A-7	Geographic Boundaries of U.S. Courts of Appeals and U.S. District Courts	A-21
A-8	29 U.S.C. § 1132 – Civil enforcement	A-23
A-9	28 U.S.C. § 1331 – Federal question	A-33
A-10	Form 5500 – Annual Return/Report of Employee Benefit Plan	A-35
A-11	<i>Sereboff v. Mid Atlantic Medical Service, Inc.</i>	A-41
A-12	<i>Great-West Life & Annuity Ins. Co. v. Knudson</i>	A-55
A-13	Curriculum Vitae of Gary L. Wickert	A-85
	Table of Cases	TC-1
	Table of Statutes	TS-1
	Table of Other Authorities	TOA-1